

M/s Kiran Prakashan, Naya Tola, Patna

Civil Writ Jurisdiction Case No.17071 of 2015

FORUM

Patna High Court

ORDER DATE

15 Dec 2016

NOTE TYPE

Source extract

01 CONCLUDING COURT PASSAGE - SOURCE EXTRACT

JUSTICE ARVIND SRIVASTAVA ORAL JUDGMENT (Per: HONOURABLE THE ACTING CHIEF JUSTICE) Date: 15-12-2016 Heard learned counsel for the parties. 2. The challenge in the present writ application is to an order passed by Commissioner, Income Tax (Appeals)-III, Patna on 9th of September, 2015 whereby, in case of block assessment, a finding was returned that notice under Section-143(2) of Income Tax Act was not issued, and that the judgment of the Supreme Court in ACIT vs. Hotel Blue Moon, reported in (2010) 321 ITR 362 is per incuriam in view of the judgment reported in (2005) 3 SCC 212 (Govt. of A.P. And Another Vs. J.B. Educational Society And Another) and (1976) 1 SCC 719 (State of Punjab & Anr. Vs. Shamlal Murari & Anr.). 3. In Hotel Blue Moon (supra), it is categorically held that the block assessment cannot be framed until notice under Section-143(2) has been served upon the assessee. Since the Commissioner of Income Tax (Appeals) has recorded a finding that notice was not served, therefore, in view of the judgment in Hotel Blue Moon's case (supra), an order of assessment could not have been passed. 4. The reasoning given by the learned Commissioner that the judgment is per incuriam is based upon two Supreme Court judgments. The said finding is not tenable. Neither of the judgments refers/deals with the case of block assessment and of not serving a notice under Section-143(2) which issue was raised and decided in Hotel Blue Moon's case (supra). 5. In view of the judgment in Hotel Blue Moon's case (supra), learned Commissioner, Income Tax (Appeals) has committed grave illegality in holding that such judgment is per incuriam. 6. Consequently the writ petition is allowed. The order passed by the learned Commissioner, Income Tax (Appeals) is set aside.

SOURCE & VERIFICATION

Supplied court copy / compilation pp. 154-156

[READ ORDER](#)

AI DISCLOSURE

AI-assisted preparation: this document was generated with AI using the identified source and may contain extraction, interpretation or omission errors. It has not been independently approved by a practising professional. Verify every material statement against the complete original order.

PROFESSIONAL DISCLAIMER

General research information only; not legal or tax advice, a certified judgment, or a substitute for the full order. Applicability depends on the facts, assessment year, statutory version and jurisdiction. Subsequent appeals, stays, reversals and legislative changes have not been checked unless expressly stated. Downloading does not create a professional engagement. Obtain case-specific advice before reliance.